

MUSLIM-AMERICAN RELATIONS IN THE PHILIPPINES, 1899-1920

PETER G. GOWING

Introduction

PRESIDENT WILLIAM MCKINLEY IN A MESSAGE TO THE American Congress in 1899 defined the basic policy of the United States towards the Philippines:

The Philippines are not ours to exploit, but to develop, to civilize, to educate, to train in the science of self-government. This is the path we must follow or be recreant to a mighty trust committed to us.¹

This policy was, as a matter of fact, a kind of self-assumed mandate (though many Americans at the time would have insisted that it was bestowed by Divine Providence!) and it came to occupy, for quite different reasons, an important place in the thinking and rhetoric of both Americans and Filipinos. The general "mandate" for the Philippines was also the particular mandate for Moroland. "To develop, to civilize, to educate, to train in the science of self-government" — these words, and the attitude they represented, established the character of Muslim-American relations — at least from the American point of view.

This paper focuses on the development of American governmental policy toward Muslim Filipinos between the years 1899 and 1920.² These years are especially important in the general story of Muslim-American relations because they cover the period of direct American administration of Moroland. During this time Moroland (and its inhabitants) became effectively a part of the Philippine national concept, and it became integrated into the Philippine governmental framework as well. An understanding of the policies pursued and problems encountered in this period yields some important insights with respect to the relations between Muslim and Christian Filipinos today.

The American administration of Moroland developed in three successive stages between 1899 and 1920. First, there were the years of initial Muslim-American contact and military occupation of Moroland, beginning in May of 1899 and ending with the inauguration of the Moro

¹ Quoted in Francis B. Harrison, *The Corner-Stone of Philippine Independence* (New York: The Century Co., 1922), page 36.

² A detailed, fully documented treatment of this subject is found in my 1968 doctoral dissertation for Syracuse University entitled: *Mandate in Moroland: The American Government of Muslim Filipinos, 1899-1920*, (xix, 893 pp. typescript in two volumes). The study has been published in microfilm by University Microfilms, Inc. It is hereinafter cited as *Mandate*.

Province in July of 1903. Next came the decade (1903-1913) of the existence of the Moro Province which exercised politico-military control over the region and prepared the Muslims for civil government. And, finally, there followed a six-year period (1914-1920) wherein the process of bringing Mindanao and Sulu into the general governmental framework of the Philippines was accelerated. During this third stage, administrative control over Muslim affairs was rapidly transferred from Americans to Filipinos.

The Military Occupation, 1899-1903

Military occupation of Moroland was occasioned by American concern to secure Muslim Filipino acknowledgement of United States sovereignty in Mindanao and Sulu. The Americans also sought to keep the Muslims neutral in the Philippine-American War (1899-1901) which raged in the northern provinces.³ Since U.S. Army authorities in Manila could not spare many troops from operations in the north, they depended on garrisons at a few strategic points in Moroland⁴ and sought by diplomacy to win Muslim friendship and neutrality.

To this end, the Bates Agreement (signed August, 1899) was negotiated with the Sulu Sultanate. Similar, though unwritten, agreements were made with the Muslim chiefs of Mindanao and Basilan. By these agreements the Muslims *seemingly* acknowledged American sovereignty and agreed to help suppress piracy and apprehend persons charged with crimes against non-Muslims. In return, the United States pledged to respect the dignity and authority of the Sultan of Sulu and the other chiefs. Muslims were to be protected from foreign impositions. The United States agreed not to interfere with the religion of the Muslims and, with respect to Sulu, to pay certain emoluments to the Sultan and his principal chiefs.⁵

The Muslim Filipinos undoubtedly saw these arrangements from a different point of view than the Americans. The Americans believed that they were keeping the Muslims peaceful and at the same time securing acknowledgement of United States sovereignty. The Muslim leaders seemed to believe that their diplomacy had kept the Americans out of their internal affairs and guaranteed their way of life on terms no worse than those which had been imposed by the Spaniards. At the beginning, the arrangements were satisfactory to both sides as a *modus vivendi*.

³ General E. S. Otis in *Annual Reports of the War Department...* 1899, Volume I, Part 4 (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1899), pp. 130-133. Henceforth War Department Annual Reports will be cited as ARWD followed by the year of preparation in parentheses.

⁴ Notably, Jolo, Zamboanga, and Cotabato.

⁵ General Bates' instructions and the text of the Agreement are found in *Treaty With the Sultan of Sulu*, Senate Document 136, 56th Congress, 1st Session (Washington: 1900). Cf. ARWD (1902), IX, p. 482.

During the years of military occupation, the U.S. Army was related to the Muslim Filipinos in much the way it had long been related to the North American Indians. The Muslims, like the Indians, were regarded as living in "a state of pupilage" on territory owned by the United States. The Army's main task was to keep them peaceful. The Army was not to antagonize the Muslims by attempting to regulate their affairs except "to prevent barbarous practices". Army activities were limited mainly to suppressing piracy, curtailing the slave trade (though-not abolishing slavery) and keeping Muslim internecine conflicts within bounds.⁶

The American mandate in the Philippines was only mildly implemented in Moroland during the period of military occupation. The policy of non-interference in Moro internal affairs precluded any vigorous effort to develop, civilize, educate, and train the Muslim Filipinos in the science of democratic self-government. Army authorities were generally unhappy with the non-interference policy because certain features of Muslim Filipino society — judicial procedures, slavery, the "tyrannical" relationship of the chiefs to their followers — offended their Occidental sense of justice and good order. Some officers were eager to take a direct hand in "civilizing" the Muslims.⁷

Within the limitations imposed by the non-interference policy, the Army did what it could to carry out the mandate, especially after the Philippine-American War ended in 1901. The proper authorities took notice of Moro affairs, studied conditions, and began to formulate policies for the future administration of Mindanao and Sulu. Modern medical care was made available to the Muslims at Army hospitals and clinics. Public health and sanitation regulations were introduced. A few schools, taught by soldiers as well as civilian teachers, were opened and the Muslims invited to attend them. Bridges, roads, trails, and wharves were constructed which both directly and indirectly benefited the Muslims.

At the same time, other activities were easily misunderstood by the Muslims. Customs regulations were imposed, taxes were levied, land surveys were made, and mapping and exploring expeditions became frequent. The 1903 Census was also begun. After July of 1901, more U.S. troops were sent to occupy ports in Mindanao.

The Muslim Filipinos could not but speculate as to what this escalation of American activity meant in terms of the security of their religion and way of life. Sometimes their uneasiness and suspicion erupted into violence. Isolated instances of attacks on American soldiers occurred with increasing frequency. In southern Lanao, the freedom of Army troops to move wherever they pleased was openly challenged by the

⁶ See Elibu Root, *The Military and Colonial Policy of the United States* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1916), pp. 320-321.

⁷ Cf. ARWD (1900), I, p. 267; (1902), IX, p. 517.

Muslims in March of 1902 and resulted in the first major military action since the American arrival in Moroland almost three years earlier.⁸

The Americans interpreted Muslim hostility as defiance of United States sovereignty. Yet the problem was certainly much more complex. The growing number of Americans in Moroland after the Philippine-American War and the multiplication of their activities, brought two quite different cultures into more abrasive contact than had been the case earlier in the military occupation. Moreover, the decision to take a direct hand in the control of Moro affairs was made towards the end of the period of military occupation. When that decision was implemented under the Moro Province, the conflict between Muslim Filipino and American cultures was exacerbated.

The Moro Province, 1903-1913

The Philippine Bill of 1902 formally committed the United States to the ultimate independence of the Philippines. Civil and military authorities then began to take a closer look at the American policy in Moroland. It was decided to abandon the policy of non-interference and to exercise direct rule over the Muslims with a view to preparing them for integration into the body politic of the Philippines. One factor which influenced this decision was the insistence of the Christian Filipino nationalists that Moroland was inseparable from the Philippine nation. Furthermore, both Americans and Filipinos fully realized the importance of the natural resources of Mindanao and Sulu to the economic future of the country.⁹

The decision to exercise direct control of Muslim affairs resulted in the abrogation of the Bates Agreement and other assurances of non-interference by Americans. In this respect, the American policy toward the Muslims again resembled the treatment of the Indians: "treaties" made with "savages" were not considered binding and could be unilaterally set aside as convenience or changes in policy demanded. Naturally, the Americans rationalized their action in terms of the misbehavior of the Muslims and also in terms of the new policy ultimately being in their (the Muslims') best interest.¹⁰

The American authorities recognized that preparation of the Moro for integration into a modern Philippine state required, for the time being, a different form of government from the regularly organized provinces wherein most of the Christian Filipinos enjoyed a large degree of autonomy. Taking their model from the Spanish "politico-military

⁸ See *Mandate*, pp. 338-349 and *ARWD* (1902), IX, pp. 481-494.

⁹ Cf. Charles B. Elliot, *The Philippines to the End of the Commission Government* (Indianapolis: The Bobbs-Merrill Co., 1917), pp. 92-94.

¹⁰ See, for example, letter of Leonard Wood to William H. Taft, December 19, 1903 in *Wood Papers* (Manuscript Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D. C.).

district" system, the Americans organized the Moro Province. The administrative structure of the Province was admirably suited for direct rule of the Muslims: the line of responsibility stretched from the Provincial Governor in Zamboanga to the datu who served as headman of the remotest tribal ward.¹¹

The officials of the government were carefully selected. Those in the higher offices were, at first, mostly Army officers. A few American civilians were appointed to such posts as Provincial Treasurer, Provincial Attorney, and Provincial Superintendent of Schools. The government of the Province was relatively free from "politics" during the ten years of its existence because it was placed under the direct supervision of the Governor-General in Manila and the Philippine Commission (dominated by Americans until 1913).

The successive governors of the Moro Province — Generals Leonard Wood, Tasker Bliss and John J. Pershing — were men of exceptional ability. For this reason they were given considerable latitude in administering provincial affairs. The power of supervision retained in Manila was used sparingly, giving the governors "the authority of a Roman pro-consul" and holding them responsible for the results.¹²

The Moro Province offered more opportunities to implement the American mandate. Slavery was made illegal. The common people, as far as possible, were protected from the "tyranny" of their traditional leaders, the depredations of lawless persons, and unscrupulous traders. Through the "tribal ward court" system, attempts were made to introduce American concepts of justice. Under American supervision, selected Moro leaders were given limited political authority as headmen in the tribal wards. The program of public works was expanded and more schools, hospitals, and dispensaries were built. Agriculture and commerce were encouraged.¹³

As part of the program to "civilize" the Muslims and at the same time exploit the natural riches of the region, Americans and Christian Filipinos from the northern provinces were encouraged to settle in Moroland. The immigrant's industriousness and agricultural know-how would, it was felt, provide both the example and the incentive for the Muslim Filipinos to become more productive farmers. The organized municipalities, dominated by the non-Muslims, were designed to be models of well-ordered and democratically governed local communities, demonstrating to the Muslims "civilized" community life.¹⁴

¹¹ The text of "An Act Providing for the Organization and Government of the Moro Province" is found in *Annual Report of the Governor of the Moro Province* 1904 (Zamboanga: 1904), pp. 113-131.

¹² J. Ralston Hayden, "What Next for the Moro?", *Foreign Affairs* 6 (1928), 638.

¹³ See *Mandate*, pp. 414-448.

¹⁴ Cf. *Annual Report of the Governor of the Moro Province*, 1904, p. 23. Henceforth, these Annual Reports will be cited as *RGMP*, followed by the year of preparation in parentheses.

The American officials believed that it was essential to get the Muslim Filipinos into the practice of paying taxes in support of the Provincial Government. Accordingly, the *cedula* (head-tax) and, later, the road tax were introduced. Fees were charged for the registration of vessels above a certain size. Export and import duties were imposed on Muslims engaged in foreign trade. Property taxes were levied on Muslims living in organized municipalities.

The Moro Province adopted the policy of respecting the Islamic religion and associated customs of the Muslim Filipinos provided they did not conflict with the basic principles of American law. The American administrators of the Province made some effort to accommodate the special features of Islamic law and *adat*, especially in cases concerning domestic relations and inheritance.¹⁵ During the administration of General Bliss, the Muslim *pandita* schools were encouraged and in some places were given limited governmental assistance.¹⁶

Even so, the American policy of direct rule and attempts to implement the mandate struck at the authority and prestige of the Muslim chiefs and, to some extent unwittingly, at the religion and attitudes of all Muslim Filipinos. The policy of direct rule was *ipso facto* an adverse judgment on the social structure, customs, and laws by which the Muslim Filipinos had lived for centuries. From the Muslim standpoint, "to develop" and "to civilize" seemed to mean the imposition of strange laws and infidel customs. Laws against slavery threatened the politico-economic structure of traditional society. The establishment of the provincial and district governments, whose officials issued decrees enforced by troops, undermined the power and status of traditional Muslim leaders. By-passing Muslim courts and refusing to recognize the customary judicial functions of the headmen offended Muslim sensitivities.¹⁷ The collection of the *cedula* and other taxes was disliked because payment was made to a foreign, infidel government.¹⁸ The Muslims resented the parcelling out of lands, which they had occupied (but not tilled) for centuries, to foreigners and Christian Filipinos. They also resented the licensing of foreign vessels to fish the waters of Moroland. The Muslims suspected that the American ambition "to educate" them meant to inculcate Christian teachings and Christian values through

¹⁵ See, for example, *RGMP* (1907), pp. 34-35, 45-46.

¹⁶ *RGMP* (1908), p. 13.

¹⁷ See the conversation between the Sulu *datus* and General Wood, quoted at length in *Mandate*, pp. 458-461.

¹⁸ The battle of Bud Dajo in 1906, which cost the lives of over 600 Muslims, was caused in part by Muslim resistance to the *cedula*. See *Mandate*, pp. 482-486.

the public school system. These teachings would alienate their children from their religion and traditional way of life.¹⁹

The American administrators of the Moro Province were either unaware of, or chose to completely ignore, the fact that Muslim Filipinos saw no separation whatever between the sacred and the secular. Separation of Church and State, religion and politics, etc. was a peculiarity of the West unknown to the Muslims. They saw Islam in everything they did; their land was *dar-al-Islam*, "the household of Islam." They believed that their laws and customs were consistent with the precepts of the Holy Qur'an. Any move to change their society or to enforce obedience to the laws of foreigners was seen as a fundamental challenge to their religion and to their very existence as human beings. The Moro Province and its policy of direct rule, then, constituted a severe threat to the ideology of the Moros. Many of them resisted to the death.

General Leonard Wood, the first Governor of the Moro Province, typified American New England Puritanical Calvinist values and Anglo-Saxon ethnocentrism. He found nothing in Muslim Filipino laws and customs worth preserving. He had only contempt for many of the Muslim leaders, including the reigning Sultan of Sulu, Jamalul Kiram II.²⁰ With all the passion of a medieval crusader he fought those Muslims who defied American laws. Thousands of them were killed battling his troops. He called them bandits and outlaws.

Wood's successors, Generals Bliss and Pershing, continued to fight "bandits" and outlaws". To be sure, the majority of the Muslim Filipinos acquiesced in the government of the Americans, some because they found it to their personal advantage to co-operate, others because they felt powerless to resist, and the rest because their contact with the foreigners was so infrequent that their life-ways were very little affected.

Yet the Muslim Filipinos who chose the path of resistance had a large base of moral support among the people. J. Ralston Hayden remarked that never during the continental expansion of the United States were armed encounters between the Indians and American troops so frequent and so serious as the conflicts that took place between the Muslim Filipinos and the American forces from 1904 to 1914.²¹ In the end, the Muslims realized that continued resistance in the face of the military control.

¹⁹ Speaking in praise of an American-run school for Moro girls in Cotabato, General Pershing remarked in 1913: "Although it is well understood that Christianity as a religion is not mentioned in the school, yet it is lived by the teachers and it may, in some measure, influence the lives of these young girls . . ." (RCMP), 1913, p. 32). Many Moros resisted sending their children to the American-run schools precisely for this reason.

²⁰ RCMP (1904), p. 9. See letter of Wood to W. H. Taft, September 5, 1903 in *Wood Papers*.

²¹ *Foreign Affairs* (1928), 638.

dern weaponry of the Americans meant annihilation. They were conquered, and, under General Pershing, they were disarmed. This accomplished, the Moro Province could be safely and fully converted to civilian

The Department of Mindanao and Sulu, 1914-1920

The appointment in December, 1913, of Frank W. Carpenter as the first civilian governor of the Moro Province, and the subsequent reorganization of the Province into the Department of Mindanao and Sulu, marked a new development in American policy towards the Muslims. Many Americans at the time felt that preparing the Muslims for integration into Philippine national life would require at least two or three generations. They were convinced that a strong American military presence would be essential for the maintenance of peace and order for a long time to come. And they were certain that if the government of Moroland were turned over to Christian Filipinos, the result would be Muslim uprisings. Christian Filipino nationalists disagreed, of course, and throughout the ten-year existence of the Moro Province they agitated for more Filipino involvement in the government of Mindanao and Sulu.²² The Democratic Party in the United States, which came to power in 1913, proved more responsive to the demands of Filipino nationalists than the Republican Party had been. President Woodrow Wilson and Governor-General Francis B. Harrison, in accord with the desire of the Democratic Party to accelerate the move towards self-government and independence for the Philippines, virtually put control of the Insular Government into the hands of the Filipinos. A policy of "Filipinization" was vigorously pursued. Frank Carpenter, appointed by Harrison as Governor of the Department of Mindanao and Sulu, was assigned the task of implementing this "Filipinization" policy.

Under Carpenter's firm and watchful supervision, Filipino officials (mostly Christians) assumed increasingly greater responsibilities in the government of Moroland.²³ The region (together with Agusan and Bukidnon) was divided into seven provinces, the governments of which were designed for easy transformation into replicas of those in the Visayas and Luzon, chiefly by the eventual substitution of elective for appointive public officials. The unification of the administrative structures of Mindanao and Sulu with those of the Philippine nation was rapidly advanced by extending to Moroland the jurisdiction of the bureaus and agencies of the Insular Government. Thus, direction of education, public works, health, and agricultural development was transferred from Zamboanga to Manila.²⁴

²² See letter of C. F. Richmond to General John J. Pershing (no date given, probably sometime in 1912) in *Pershing Papers*, (Manuscript Division, Library of Congress, Washington, D. C.) and also the clipping from *La Democracia* (September 2, 1910) in the same place. See also *Mandate*, pp. 658-668.

²³ *Ibid.*, pp. 696-698.

²⁴ *Ibid.*, pp. 686-688.

The progressive development of the seven provincial governments and the expansion of centralized administration and control of public services in Moroland were intended eventually to make the Department Government obsolete as an intermediary between the Insular Government and the provinces of Mindanao and Sulu. In May of 1920, the Department Government in Zamboanga was formally abolished and its powers of supervision and administration were transferred to the Insular Department of the Interior in Manila. Thereafter Moro affairs were controlled by the Insular Government directly through the Bureau of Non-Christian Tribes in the Department of Interior.²⁵

Before its abolition, the Department of Mindanao and Sulu went quite far in implementing the American mandate among Muslim Filipinos. This was possible, of course, partly because the power of the Muslims to resist had been broken under the Moro Province. But the American policy-makers, and later the Philippine Legislature, which assumed legislative control of affairs in Moroland, exhibited genuine humanitarian concern for the condition and progress of the Muslim Filipinos. Under Governor Carpenter's wise and tactful supervision, Filipino officials got down to the hammer-and-tongs work of educating, civilizing, and training in self-government the half-million Muslims in their care. In the process, the old mandate was given a new name: it was called "the policy of attraction."²⁶

Public schools multiplied (from 72 in 1913 to 336 in 1919) and attendance was made compulsory. Muslim *pensionados* (Government scholarship awardees) were sent to Manila and America for higher education. Hospitals and field dispensaries were provided in such numbers that medical care came within the reach of nearly all the inhabitants. Public works were greatly expanded; hundreds of kilometers of new roads and trails ended the isolation of thousands of inhabitants and brought them into contact with commercial and governmental centers. The Muslims were given greater participation in local and provincial governments. Later, some were even appointed to the Philippine Legislature.²⁷

Muslim leaders were periodically taken to Manila as guests of the Government so that, on their return, they would be apostles of peace and even more co-operative with government officials.²⁸ The agricultural activities of the Muslims were given every encouragement. In Cotabato Province, Muslim families together with Christian families successfully participated, at least for a few years, in the "agricultural colonies" estab-

²⁵ W. C. Forbes, *The Philippine Islands*, Volume II (Boston: Houghton Mifflin & Co., 1928), p. 30.

²⁶ See Charles E. Russell, *The Outlook for the Philippines*, (New York: The Century Co., 1922), pp. 266-268.

²⁷ *Mandate*, pp. 701, 754-769.

²⁸ Cf. the account of Datu Alamada's Visit to Manila in *ibid.*, p. 709.

lished by the Government as experiments in land development and inter-group living.²⁹

These developments under the Department of Mindanao and Sulu were no less threatening to traditional Muslim life-ways than the activities of the Moro Province. But as was said earlier, the Muslims were in no position to resist by force of arms. What evidence there is concerning their general attitude in this period seems to suggest that it might have been a sullen acquiescence in a situation they were powerless to change.³⁰ Perhaps no single event better illustrates and symbolizes this attitude than the abdication (at the insistence of Governor Carpenter) by Sultan Jamalul Kiram II of all his claims to temporal power in Sulu. The abdication was formalized in an Agreement signed on March 22, 1915.³¹

Of course, some Muslims readily submitted to the program of assimilation enthusiastically pushed by the Government. Many, however, clung tenaciously to the old ways, and a few — far fewer than under the Moro Province — chose to become “outlaws.”

With the abolition of the Department of Mindanao and Sulu and the transfer of Governor Carpenter to other service in the Insular Government, the effective period of American administration in Moroland came to an end. There continued to be American governors in the Provinces of Lanao (until 1930) and Sulu (until 1935), and the American Governor-General continued to have considerable power to interfere in the conduct of government in Mindanao and Sulu.³² But, for the most part, administrative as well as legislative control of Moroland was firmly in Filipino hands where it has remained ever since (except for the years of Japanese occupation).

Concluding Reflections

In his final report as the last of the “politico-military” governors of the Moro Province, General Pershing summed up what, in his view, was the total achievement of a decade of government largely by Army officers: “Up to the present we have gone no further than to suppress crime, prevent injustice, establish peaceful conditions, and maintain supervisory control.”³³

²⁹ *Ibid.*, pp. 736-741.

³⁰ Significantly, serious disorders broke out in Moroland in the 1920's.

³¹ A full account of the Agreement, including a copy of its text and other valuable appendices is given in the Annual Report of Governor Carpenter in *Manuscript Report of the Philippine Commission January 1 to December 31, 1915*, Volume 4 (in National Archives, Washington, D. C.), pp. 3120-3145.

³² As, for example, when Governor-General Leonard Wood late in 1921 summarily replaced the first Filipino Governor of Lanao Province (Capt. Paulino Santos of the Constabulary) with an American.

³³ *RGMP* (1913), p. 72.

Certainly it can be shown that something more than that was achieved by the Moro Province. The fact is that the ground *was* prepared for civil government. The development of the land and people of Mindanao and Sulu *was* carried forward. In short, there was a direct connection between what had been accomplished by 1913 and what had been achieved by 1920.

The work of the Moro Province made it possible for the Department of Mindanao and Sulu to pursue its "policy of attraction" toward the inhabitants; to reduce greater Muslim participation in governmental affairs; to further the integration of the people of Moroland into the body politic of the Philippine nation; and to gain their acceptance of — or at least acquiescence in — the collection of taxes, the operation of schools, the abdication of the Sultan of Sulu, and the presence of Christian Filipino officials in positions of authority among them. Under Governor Carpenter's administration, all these *possibilities* became *realities*.

In the process, the usefulness of the Department Government diminished. The Department accomplished what it was established to do: it *laid the foundations* in Mindanao and Sulu for an enduring edifice of economic, political, and even social solidarity with Luzon and the Visayas. Having finished this task — or at least having carried it fairly far along — the Department, like the Moro Province before it, properly and inevitably passed into history.

But it is one thing to lay a foundation and quite another to construct the edifice. A few years of American administration could hardly be expected to solve all the problems standing in the way of the integration of the Muslim Filipinos into Philippine national life. The biggest problem in 1920 was — and still is — the centuries-old animosity between Muslims and Christian Filipinos.³⁴ The American Government did not exacerbate that animosity. It went to considerable trouble to improve relations between the two groups. However, after 1920, the American Government exercised little direct control over the relations between Muslim and Christians in the Philippines. The future was in the hands of the two principals. And because they were left with the greater power, the responsibility rested primarily with the Christian Filipinos.

³⁴ See the discussion of the "Moro Image" in my *Mosque and Moro: A Study of Muslims in the Philippines* (Manila: Philippine Federation of Christian Churches, 1964), pp. 29-30, 83-86.